



# The Duty of Universities and the Right to the City: Balancing Campus Expansion with Community Impacts

By Mitsuki Nishimoto

October 2022 | [www.legacyofslavery.harvard.edu/case-studies](http://www.legacyofslavery.harvard.edu/case-studies) and [www.justiceinschools.org](http://www.justiceinschools.org)

Inadequate housing for college students has recently garnered public attention and concern, from deteriorating and unsafe dorm conditions at historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs)<sup>1,2</sup> to a new dorm that would offer housing for thousands of students but place many of them in windowless single rooms<sup>3</sup> to the rise in expensive, luxury dorms on various campuses.<sup>4</sup> The scarcity of affordable housing options, both on and off campus, continues to be a significant source of stress for students across the country.<sup>5</sup> Students who are unable to find housing near campus may be forced to commute for hours or sleep in their cars on campus.<sup>6</sup> Federal and institutional policies that underestimate living costs can lead low-income students to struggle and even drop out.<sup>7</sup> The COVID-19 pandemic has also exacerbated the housing, food, and economic insecurity that students face.<sup>8</sup> In a 2021 survey by the Hope Center, 48 percent of college students across the United States reported being affected by housing insecurity, and 14 percent experienced being unhoused.<sup>9</sup>

Housing-related tensions between universities and their surrounding communities made headlines on March 3, 2022, when the Supreme Court of California ordered the University of California, Berkeley, to freeze their student enrollment numbers for the next academic year as a result of a lawsuit brought forth by a group of local residents.<sup>10</sup> The group, Save Berkeley's Neighborhoods, argued that the university had been admitting more students than the school and city can handle and is not providing enough on-campus housing. As a result, they claimed, students had moved into surrounding neighborhoods, increasing housing prices and displacing residents.<sup>11</sup> Indeed, UC Berkeley provides housing for only 22 percent of their undergraduate students,<sup>12</sup> and in 2021, 5,000 students who applied for on-campus housing were wait-listed and forced to seek housing elsewhere.<sup>13</sup>

UC Berkeley appealed the ruling, claiming that the enrollment freeze would result in a loss of at least \$57 million, which would have consequences for their "ability to deliver instruction, provide financial aid for low- and middle-income students, adequately fund critical student services, and maintain [their] facilities."<sup>14</sup> As public universities have increasingly had to rely on tuition fees for revenue following decades of declining state and federal funding,<sup>15</sup> changes in enrollment numbers can negatively impact the entire campus community. As an immediate solution to circumvent cutting enrollment numbers entirely, the university said they would urge a group of incoming undergraduates to defer enrollment for a semester or study remotely in the fall and start in person the following semester.<sup>16</sup>

A week after the ruling, the California State Legislature found a way to let UC Berkeley maintain their original enrollment numbers by making an adjustment to a state environmental law.<sup>17, 18</sup> UC Berkeley's enrollment numbers will not be enforced, for now. However, the issues that the lawsuit raises will not be going away, as the university is facing pressures to expand in the name of increasing opportunity and access to education. The UC schools receive a record-breaking number of applications from students around the world each year.<sup>19</sup> Furthermore, with high school graduation rates increasing in California, especially among Latine students, more in-state students are seeking a seat at their public universities.<sup>20</sup> In 2021, officials announced that the UC system plans to enroll 20,000 more students by 2030 across its nine campuses, four of which (including UC Berkeley) will reduce out-of-state enrollments in order to enroll 4,500 more

in-state students by 2026.<sup>21</sup> State lawmakers have pledged \$2 billion to build affordable student housing across all of California’s public postsecondary institutions,<sup>22</sup> but construction will not happen overnight.

Issues surrounding a rapidly growing campus community are not unique to UC Berkeley. What principles and values should guide universities, policymakers, and community members in making decisions about increasing access to universities amid insufficient affordable housing?

## University Expansion: Past and Present Impacts on Communities

University expansion has a long history of displacing and gentrifying neighboring communities, especially Black communities.

In the 1950s and ’60s, for example, the expansion of the University of Pennsylvania, Drexel University, and University of the Sciences displaced the residents of Black Bottom, a vibrant and close-knit Black community in West Philadelphia.<sup>23</sup> Today, University City Science Center (UCSC) buildings stand where a section of Black Bottom once was.<sup>24</sup> The UCSC, a research and innovation hub, was originally built with the goal of recruiting talented scientists, scholars, and corporations to the area.<sup>25</sup> The three universities partnered with each other, the Presbyterian Hospital, and Philadelphia College of Osteopathic Medicine to form the West Philadelphia Corporation (WPC) and strengthen efforts to establish the UCSC.<sup>26</sup> The City of Philadelphia—Philadelphia’s City Planning Commission and the Redevelopment Authority—bolstered the WPC’s interests by declaring Black Bottom as blighted, using eminent domain to take over the land and bulldozing the neighborhood.<sup>27</sup> Despite protests by neighborhood residents and university students, this destructive effort in the name of urban renewal displaced an estimated total of 5,000 residents.<sup>28</sup>

Urban campuses around the country continue to expand, resulting in displacement of people and alterations in the urban landscape. Columbia University is building their new Manhattanville campus as part of a plan to “revitalize the four former industrial blocks ... into an environmentally sustainable and publicly accessible center for academic and civic life woven into the fabric of the West Harlem community.”<sup>29</sup> Manhattanville’s minority-owned businesses and historic structures—gas stations, auto shops, laundromats, dairy plants—have been replaced by towering glass buildings.<sup>30</sup> Although Columbia has committed funds toward numerous benefits for West Harlem residents, such as housing, relocation payments, and access to facilities and services, among others,<sup>31</sup> the university expansion forced the relocation of community members.<sup>32</sup>

Harvard is planning a similar and much larger campus expansion in the Allston area of Boston. Here, the University owns 140 acres of land<sup>33</sup> and has a long-term goal of transforming “obsolete and mostly impermeable industrial properties into new, vibrant, equitable and welcoming districts.”<sup>34</sup> Like Columbia, Harvard offers opportunities to engage with Allston residents through the Harvard Ed Portal. This initiative connects Harvard’s resources to students in Boston Public Schools, funds local organizations, and offers programming in workforce development, wellness, and the arts, among others.<sup>35</sup> The University has also pledged to set aside 25 percent of housing as affordable housing and 25 percent of retail space for minority-owned businesses as well as created a \$25 million housing fund for residents of Allston and neighboring Brighton.<sup>36</sup> While the first phase of campus development received unanimous approval from the Boston Planning and Development Agency in July 2022,<sup>37</sup> neighborhood groups and residents have expressed concerns that Harvard’s expansion has contributed to increased rental prices and gentrification in Allston, as the area has become a more desirable place to live, especially for Harvard students, staff, and faculty.<sup>38, 39</sup>

These community tensions persist across the greater Boston area, which is home to numerous universities and their students. For instance, residents in East Boston, a historically working-class and immigrant neighborhood, have noticed changes in the community’s housing and economic infrastructure with an increase in students and young professionals living in the area.<sup>40</sup> Knowing that students are willing to—and often must—pay higher rent for a short amount of time, landlords have been increasing rent and altering lease terms for long-term residents, as well.<sup>41</sup> Residents argue that universities should take responsibility. City leadership has agreed; former Mayor Marty Walsh urged universities to create housing for 18,500 students and reduce the number of undergraduates living off-campus by 50 percent by 2030.<sup>42</sup> However, implementation has not been so easy. For example, Northeastern University’s plan to build a new student dorm in Roxbury, the “heart of Black culture in Boston,”<sup>43</sup> has been met with concerns from local residents about displacement and gentrification.<sup>44</sup>

## Campus Expansion for Student Housing at UC Berkeley

One could argue that universities should be restricted to building new structures on land that they already own to avoid expansion into the community, but this does not eliminate potential problems. UC Berkeley is currently building two student dorms on land they own, although they are destroying a rent-controlled building and a historic park in the process.

The first dorm, which will house 772 transfer students, came at the cost of the eviction of residents in eight rent-controlled units in 2021.<sup>45</sup> On one hand, increased support for transfer students, especially those transferring from community colleges, is crucial. In addition, the university has pledged that rental revenue from the dorm will support scholarships for 100 first-generation, low-income students.<sup>46</sup> On the other hand, eviction and destruction have severe consequences.<sup>47</sup> Students and community members fought against this development for months.<sup>48</sup> UC Berkeley explored relocating the rent-controlled building but ultimately did not do so, citing time constraints.<sup>49</sup> Instead, they offered each renter a relocation package that included a six-figure payout and assistance finding new housing.<sup>50</sup>

The second dorm will house 1,100 students but would be located atop People's Park, a historic site for Berkeley's counterculture movement in the 1960s.<sup>51</sup> In 1967, UC Berkeley and the city used eminent domain to purchase the land in People's Park for the purpose of building new dorms, which was met with protests and resulted in a violent clash between students, residents, police, and the National Guard.<sup>52</sup> The park has been a contested space since then, and the university has pledged to leave half of the park as an open space to honor its history, while the other half will be used for the dorm.<sup>53</sup> In response to community concerns about unhoused people currently living in an encampment in the park who will be displaced, the university is working with the state to provide funding for temporary housing during the construction period, and they will also donate a part of the land to a nonprofit to build a housing complex with on-site supportive services for more than 100 unhoused individuals.<sup>54</sup> Despite these commitments, the planned dorm continues to draw fierce opposition. In August 2022, students and community members protested, clashing with construction crews. The university temporarily halted construction of the dorm,<sup>55</sup> and its future remains uncertain.<sup>56</sup>

## Coda

Universities have immense potential to positively impact their communities. They employ local residents, offer public spaces such as libraries and outdoor grounds, produce knowledge, and, above all, provide educational opportunities. However, university expansion—at times sanctioned by local governments and other private entities—can result in harm. How should we consider these tradeoffs so that universities can balance their duty to their students and their communities? How can we ensure universities are living up to their promise and potential as a public good? ■

# Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude to my teachers and peers in the course Harvard and the Legacy of Slavery: A Normative Case-Study Writing Initiative at the Harvard Graduate School of Education (EDU A405). This case study would not have been possible without unwavering guidance from Meira Levinson, the Juliana W. and William Foss Thompson Professor of Education and Society; Caroline Tucker; and Orelia Jonathan. I would like to extend my sincere thanks to Leah Robinson for her feedback and support throughout my writing process. I am also grateful to Cat Huang and Kate Daversa for their comments on my research and drafts.

Thank you to Harvard Radcliffe Institute for its support, and I am especially grateful to Cristine Hutchinson-Jones and Alexander Ferrell for their valuable feedback. I am indebted to many folks at the Harvard Graduate School of Education who participated in field tests, which illustrated the possibilities of the use and discussion of this case. Many thanks, also, to Jeb Polstein for his edits and for sharing his insights on planning and housing.

Finally, I would like to thank all of my A405 colleagues for their community and collective engagement in grappling with the history and legacies of slavery at Harvard and beyond. Thank you for teaching me what a dilemma is—for whom and why—and what simply is not up for debate.

# Notes

- 1 Oyin Adedoyin and Kate Hidalgo Bellows, “What Led to Howard U.’s Longest Protest Ever,” *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, November 4, 2021, <https://www.chronicle.com/article/what-led-to-howard-u-s-longest-protest-ever>
- 2 For information on the inequitable funding of HBCUs compared to non-HBCUs, see American Council on Education, *Public and Private Investments and Divestments in Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, January 2019, <https://www.acenet.edu/Documents/public-and-private-investments-and-divestments-in-hbcus.pdf>
- 3 Morgan Sung, “Windowless, billionaire-designed UC Santa Barbara mega dorm horrifies the internet,” *NBC News*, November 3, 2021, <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/uc-santa-barbara-mega-dorm-munger-hall-rcna4401>
- 4 Rebecca Burns, “Luxury private student housing further divides rich and poor on campuses,” *Hechinger Report*, August 27, 2019, <https://hechingerreport.org/luxury-private-student-housing-further-divides-rich-and-poor-on-campuses/>
- 5 Susan Svrluga, “Rising rents add to college students’ scramble for affordable housing,” *Washington Post*, August 9, 2022, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/education/2022/08/09/college-student-housing-costs/>
- 6 Janie Har, “Housing shortage, soaring rents squeeze US college students,” *ABC News*, April 26, 2022, <https://abcnews.go.com/Business/wireStory/housing-shortage-soaring-rents-squeeze-us-college-students-84315855>
- 7 U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, Office of Policy Development and Research, *Insights into Housing and Community Development Policy*, February 2015, [https://www.huduser.gov/portal/periodicals/insight/insight\\_2.pdf](https://www.huduser.gov/portal/periodicals/insight/insight_2.pdf)
- 8 “COVID-19 intensifying college students’ housing, food insecurity,” *Georgetown University: The Feed*, June 26, 2020, <https://feed.georgetown.edu/access-affordability/covid-19-intensifying-college-students-housing-food-insecurity/>
- 9 The Hope Center for College, Community, and Justice, *#RealCollege 2021: Basic Needs Insecurity During The Ongoing Pandemic*, March 31, 2021, <https://hope4college.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/RCReport2021.pdf>
- 10 Shawn Hubler, Conor Dougherty, and Sophie Kasakove, “Berkeley vs. Berkeley Is a Fight Over the California Dream,” *New York Times*, March 10, 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/03/10/us/uc-berkeley-student-housing.html>
- 11 Katherine Mangan, “Court Orders Berkeley to Slash New Undergraduate Enrollment by a Third,” *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, February 15, 2022, <https://www.chronicle.com/article/court-orders-berkeley-to-slash-new-undergraduate-enrollment-by-a-third>
- 12 Shawn Hubler, “Legislators Find Way to Let U.C. Berkeley Increase Its Enrollment,” *New York Times*, March 11, 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/03/11/us/berkeley-enrollment-ceqa.html>
- 13 Frances Dinkelspiel, “The end of the 1960s? Regents vote to put housing in People’s Park,” *Berkeleyside*, September 30, 2021, <https://www.berkeleyside.org/2021/09/30/student-housing-berkeley-peoples-park>
- 14 “UC Berkeley statement on court decision affecting 2022-23 academic year enrollment,” *Berkeley News*, February 14, 2022, <https://news.berkeley.edu/2022/02/14/uc-berkeley-statement-on-court-decision-affecting-2022-23-academic-year-enrollment/>
- 15 American Academy of Arts & Sciences, *Public Research Universities: Changes in State Funding*, 2015, [https://www.amacad.org/sites/default/files/academy/multimedia/pdfs/publications/researchpapersmonographs/PublicResearchUniv\\_ChangesInStateFunding.pdf](https://www.amacad.org/sites/default/files/academy/multimedia/pdfs/publications/researchpapersmonographs/PublicResearchUniv_ChangesInStateFunding.pdf)
- 16 Michael Levenson, “U.C. Berkeley Must Freeze Enrollment, California Supreme Court Says,” *New York Times*, March 3, 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/03/03/us/uc-berkeley-admissions-enrollment.html>
- 17 Hubler, “Legislators Find Way to Let U.C. Berkeley Increase Its Enrollment.”
- 18 The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires entities to disclose and minimize the environmental impact of proposed development projects. Save Berkeley’s Neighborhoods had argued that the university failed to adhere to the law’s requirements because the growing student population contributed to increased pollution (e.g., trash, traffic, noise) in the city. The adjustment to the law removes student enrollment from CEQA considerations and allows university leaders to take 18 months to address any environmental concerns. See Hubler, “Legislators Find Way to Let U.C. Berkeley Increase Its Enrollment.”
- 19 Olivia Branan, “UC receives record-breaking number of applications for fall 2022,” *The Daily Californian*, March 1, 2022, <https://www.dailycal.org/2022/03/01/uc-receives-record-breaking-number-of-applications-for-fall-2022/>
- 20 Sara Weissman, “Growing Latinx Enrollment, Not Enough Support,” *Inside Higher Ed*, November 10, 2021, <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2021/11/10/report-shows-continued-equity-gaps-latinx-californians?v2>
- 21 Teresa Watanabe, “UC could add 20,000 seats for students by 2030 to meet surging enrollment demand,” *Los Angeles*

- Times, October 1, 2021, <https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2021-10-01/uc-seeks-enrollment-hike-to-meet-college-admission-demand>
- 22 California Legislative Analyst's Office, *The 2022-23 Budget: Student Housing*, April 8, 2022, <https://lao.ca.gov/Publications/Report/4589>
- 23 "Black Bottom," accessed May 7, 2022, <https://theblackbottom.wordpress.com/communities/blackbottom/history/>
- 24 John Puckett, "The University City Science Center and the Black Bottom," *West Philadelphia Collaborative History*, accessed September 5, 2022, <https://collaborativehistory.gse.upenn.edu/stories/university-city-science-center-and-black-bottom>
- 25 Ibid.
- 26 Ibid.
- 27 Ibid.
- 28 Taylor Allen, "As building boom continues in West Philly, Black Bottom Tribe fights for a sign of the community they lost," *WHYY*, August 9, 2021, <https://whyy.org/articles/as-building-boom-continues-in-west-philly-black-bottom-tribe-fights-for-a-sign-of-the-community-they-lost/>
- 29 "Manhattanville," *Columbia University Neighbors*, accessed May 7, 2022, <https://neighbors.columbia.edu/content/manhattanville>
- 30 Nathan Kensinger, "As Columbia University moves into Manhattanville, its industrial past is erased," *Curbed New York*, March 18, 2018, <https://ny.curbed.com/2018/3/8/17095838/manhattanville-columbia-university-expansion-photo-essay>
- 31 "Community Commitments," *Columbia University Neighbors*, accessed September 5, 2022, <https://neighbors.columbia.edu/content/community-commitments>
- 32 Mary Marsh, "After Displacement from Manhattanville, a Community Remains Resilient," *Columbia Spectator*, November 16, 2018, <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/the-eye/2018/11/16/what-happened-to-the-residents-of-602-west-132nd-st/>
- 33 Jon Chesto, "Harvard's big plans in Allston face growing pushback from the neighbors," *Boston Globe*, March 15, 2022, <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2022/03/15/business/harvards-big-plans-allston-face-growing-push-neighborhood/>
- 34 "Lapp Letter," *Harvard Magazine*, March 17, 2022, <https://www.harvardmagazine.com/2022/03/lapp-letter>
- 35 "Program Areas," *Harvard Ed Portal*, accessed May 7, 2022, <https://edportal.harvard.edu/program-areas>
- 36 "Green light for first phase of Harvard's Enterprise Research Campus," *Harvard Gazette*, July 18, 2022, <https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2022/07/green-light-for-first-phase-of-enterprise-research-campus/>
- 37 Ibid.
- 38 Maribel Cervantes and James R. Jolin, "'Just Not Fair': As Allston's Housing Costs Rise, Residents Turn to Harvard for Answers," *The Harvard Crimson*, October 6, 2021, <https://www.thecrimson.com/article/2021/10/6/allston-affordability-crisis/>
- 39 Note that the demographics of Allston and Brighton differ from other neighborhoods mentioned in this case, such as West Harlem or Roxbury. In 2010, Allston was 57% white, 20% Asian, 5% Black, and 13% Latinx. Brighton was 70% white, 13% Asian, 4% Black, and 9% Latinx. See "Boston Neighborhood Demographics 1950-2010," *City of Boston*, accessed September 5, 2022, <https://data.boston.gov/dataset/neighborhood-demographics/resource/7154cc09-55c4-4acd-99a5-3a233d11e699>
- 40 Erin Nolan, "Eastbound And Gown: As Students Displace Longtime East Bostonians, A Community Welcomes Newcomers But Not Without Some Concerns," *Dig Boston*, September 10, 2019, <https://digboston.com/eastbound-and-gown-as-students-displace-longtime-east-bostonians-a-community-welcomes-newcomers-but-not-without-some-concerns/>
- 41 Ibid.
- 42 *City of Boston, Student Housing Trends 2018-2019 Academic Year, 2019*, [https://www.boston.gov/sites/default/files/embed/b/boston\\_student\\_housing\\_trends\\_ay\\_18-19\\_190509.pdf](https://www.boston.gov/sites/default/files/embed/b/boston_student_housing_trends_ay_18-19_190509.pdf)
- 43 "Roxbury," *City of Boston*, March 18, 2021, <https://www.boston.gov/neighborhood/roxbury>
- 44 Tim Logan and Milton Valencia, "Northeastern's plan for a 25-story dorm on the edge of Roxbury poses a test for Janey," *Boston Globe*, May 6, 2021, <https://www.bostonglobe.com/2021/05/06/business/northeasterns-plan-25-story-dorm-edge-roxbury-poses-test-janey/?event=event12>
- 45 Frances Dinkenspiel, "'No real options': Last tenants agree to leave rent-controlled building, clearing way for UC Berkeley dorm," *Berkeleyside*, September 22, 2021, <https://www.berkeleyside.org/2021/09/22/walnut-street-rent-controlled-building-uc-berkeley-anchor-house>
- 46 Ibid.
- 47 1921 Walnut St. Association, "Why 1921 Walnut St. matters," *The Daily Californian*, July 7, 2021, <https://www.dailycal.org/2021/07/07/why-1921-walnut-st-matters/>

- 48 Riley Cooke and Cameron Fozi, “The Fight for 1921 Walnut St.” *The Daily Californian*, May 4, 2022, <https://dailycal-projects.netlify.app/2022-05-04-1921-timeline>
- 49 Dinkenspiel, “‘No real options’: Last tenants agree to leave rent-controlled building, clearing way for UC Berkeley dorm.”
- 50 Ibid.
- 51 Dinkenspiel, “The end of the 1960s? Regents vote to put housing in People’s Park.”
- 52 Soumya Karlamangla, “The Past and Future of People’s Park,” *New York Times*, October 25, 2021, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/10/25/us/peoples-park-berkeley.html>
- 53 Dinkenspiel, “The end of the 1960s? Regents vote to put housing in People’s Park.”
- 54 Frances Dinkenspiel, “4 stories shorter: UC Berkeley drops height of People’s Park student housing complex,” *Berkeleyside*, August 25, 2021, <https://www.berkeleyside.org/2021/08/25/uc-berkeley-student-housing-peoples-park>
- 55 Katherine Mangan, “Bursting at the Seams and Battling in Court, Berkeley Faces an ‘Urgent and Real’ Student-Housing Crisis,” *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, August 25, 2022, <https://www.chronicle.com/article/bursting-at-the-seams-and-battling-in-court-berkeley-faces-an-urgent-and-real-student-housing-crisis>
- 56 As of October 30, 2022, there have been no publicly announced updates about the construction.